LASER PLASMA PACS numbers: 52.50.Jm; 52.38.Ph; 52.70.La DOI: 10.1070/QE2011v041n08ABEH014669

# New method of comparison for electron temperature measurements in plasmas using X-ray spectra of heavy elements

A.P. Shevelko

Abstract. Conditions and applicability limits of a new X-ray spectroscopy method for electron temperature measurements in plasmas of heavy elements are considered. The method is based on comparison of spectra under study with those of well diagnosed laser-produced plasmas. To apply the method for diagnosing tungsten plasmas a thorough analysis of laserproduced plasma spectra has been performed. The analysis included investigation of spectrum peculiarities and determination of electron temperatures. Quantitative data were obtained for determining electron temperatures in tungsten plasmas using relative intensities of spectral peaks in the spectral range  $\lambda = 3 - 6$  nm.

Keywords: diagnostics of high-temperature plasmas, multiply-charged ions, X-ray spectra.

## 1. Introduction

X-ray spectroscopy of multiply-charged ions is a most efficient method for studying high-temperature plasmas, which is widely used for diagnosing laboratory and astrophysical plasmas. Presently, the most developed methods are based on diagnosing the spectra of hydrogenand helium-like (H- and He-like) multiply-charged ions [1, 2]. In particular, the electron temperature  $T_e$  is determined from the ratio of dielectronic satellite intensities to that of a reference resonance line. The resonance lines and the corresponding dielectronic satellites are excited from the same ion states; hence, the lines are emitted from the s[ame](#page-2-0) plasma domains, and the ionisation state does not affect the measured temperature  $T_e$ .

X-ray spectra of heavy-element plasma (of elements with large atomic weights  $A_Z$ ) usually exhibit a complicated structure distinct from that of H- and He-like ions. They also include many spectral lines originated from ions of different ionisation stages. The overlapping lines in the spectra result in a quasi-continuum. This noticeably hinders spectral diagnostics of such plasma. Nevertheless, these spectra are often of great interest in scientific investigations, for example, molybdenum and tungsten spectra in tokamak plasmas (materials of a divertor [3]), tungsten spectra in high

A.P. Shevelko P.N. Lebedev Physics Institute, Russian Academy of Sciences, Leninsky prosp. 53, 119991 Moscow, Russia; e-mail: shevelko@rambler.ru

Received 15 June 2011 Kvantovaya Elektronika  $41$  (8)  $726 - 728$  (2011) Translated by N.A. Raspopov

power Z-pinch plasmas (a material for wire arrays [4]), stannum spectra in plasma sources for projection EUV lithography [5].

In most cases, the coronal equilibrium is valid for multiply-charged ions [6]. In the coronal model, u[nlike](#page-2-0) the thermodynamic equilibrium, the degree of ionisation is independ[ent o](#page-2-0)f the electron density  $N_e$ . In this model, the spectrum structure and ionisation composition of a stationary plasma are desc[ribe](#page-2-0)d by a single parameter, namely, the electron temperature  $T<sub>e</sub>$ , which allows one to compare spectra of different plasma sources by this parameter.

In [7], a new method was proposed for determining the electron temperature of iron plasma. This is based on a comparison of the spectra under study with those of wellstudied laser-produced plasma. The method is successfully employed for diagnosing iron plasmas produced in a final anode-[ca](#page-2-0)thode gap of the high-current pulsed Z-Machine generator (Sandia National Laboratories, USA) [7]. Further development of the method, expansion it to other elements and a wider temperature range are worthwhile. The present work is aimed at developing the method for diagnosing tungsten plasma. With this purpose, tungsten spectra in laser-produced plasmas were thoroughly analy[sed](#page-2-0) and the spectral ranges were found sensitive to the electron temperature; quantitative data were obtained for determining the plasma temperature.

## 2. Description of the method and conditions of applicability

In the new method for determining the electron temperature  $T<sub>e</sub>$  of heavy-element plasmas it is proposed to compare the studied spectra with those of well-diagnosed laser-produced plasmas [8] (see Fig. 1). In this approach, the important property of laser-produced plasmas is used: at moderate flux densities of laser nanosecond pulsed radiation on a target, the electron temperature of a hot plasma core mainly depends on the flux magnitude and only weakly depends [on](#page-2-0) the atomic weight of a target material [9, 10]. This is explained by mutual compensation of the two factors: at fixed temperature  $T_e$ , the ionisation losses increase with an increase in  $A_z$ ; however, they are compensated by an increase in the absorbed en[ergy of](#page-2-0) laser radiation per ion [9, 10].

Diagnostics of laser-produced plasmas is performed by spectra of light elements whose structure is similar to that of H- and He-like ions, for which the corresponding methods of temperature measur[ements](#page-2-0) are well developed (see, e.g., [1, 2]). The spectral structure and intensity distribution of heavy-element plasmas are very sensitive to  $T_e$ , this fact is



Figure 1. Scheme of measuring the heavy-element plasma temperature.

used for plasma diagnostics. The spectra of heavy elements are studied at the same laser intensities on a target as in the case of light elements. Thus, we may ascribe a certain temperature to each spectrum. A comparison of spectra 'calibrated' by  $T_e$  with those of the source under study makes it possible to estimate the temperature of the source (see Fig. 1).

For employing the method, equal conditions are required for the investigated and laser-produced plasmas (the reference diagnosed plasma). These conditions are a coronal equilibrium, equilibrium ionisation, and quasi-stationary state of both plasmas. There is an additional condition for laser-produced plasmas - weak or known dependence of  $T_e$  on the atomic weight  $A_Z$  of the target material. An experimental condition of the method is employment of calibrated or the same spectrometers in studying the spectra of heavy elements in laser-produced plasmas and in the plasma source under investigation. An optical thickness, spatial and time inhomogeneity of plasma sources require separate consideration.

The conditions of method applicability impose limitations on the laser intensity q and temperature  $T<sub>e</sub>$  of laserproduced plasma [8]. Equilibrium ionisation and weak dependence of  $T_e$  on  $A_Z$  occur in nanosecond laser plasma at  $q < 10^{14}$  W cm<sup>-2</sup>. A limitation on q in measuring the electron temperature by the spectra of H- and He-like ions is as follows:  $q > 10^{12}$  W cm<sup>-2</sup>. Thus, in the case of nanosecond laser plasma, [th](#page-2-0)e method may be applied in the range of laser intensities  $10^{12} \le q \le 10^{14}$  W cm<sup>-2</sup>, which corresponds to the electron temperature range  $100 \le T_e \le$ 1000 eV. These are the conditions that limit employment of the method.

As it was mentioned, the new method proposed for diagnosing plasmas of heavy elements is based on the weak dependence of the electron temperature  $T<sub>e</sub>$  on the atomic weight of the target material  $A_Z$ . In [9], a review is given of the results of numerous experimental works on measuring the temperature  $T_e$  in laser-produced plasmas over a wide range of laser intensities on a target q  $(q = 10^9 - 10^{14} \text{ W cm}^{-2})$ . It was shown that the temperature is well described by the for[mul](#page-2-0)a  $T_e \sim q^{4/9}$ , and is almost the same for different targets from hydrogen to tungsten. A theoretical model for a quasi-stationary model and inverse Bremsstrahlung absorption in plasmas in the case of nanosecond pulses gives the following dependence of the temperature  $T_e$  on  $q$ ,  $A_Z$ , and ion charge  $Z$  [10, 11]:

$$
T_e \propto q^{4/9} A_Z^{2/9} \left(\frac{Z}{Z+1}\right)^{2/3}.\tag{1}
$$

This model predicts that the weak dependence of  $T<sub>e</sub>$  [on](#page-2-0) the

atomic weight of the target material  $(T_e \sim A_Z^{2/9})$  should hold up to  $q \sim 10^{14} \text{ W cm}^{-2}$ .

#### 3. Analysis of tungsten spectra

Spectra of tungsten laser plasma were recorded at Brigham Young University (BYU), USA [12, 13]. The laser-produced plasmas were created by radiation of an Infinity Nd: YAG laser  $(0.53 \mu m, 200 \text{ mJ}, 3 \text{ ns}, 10 \text{ Hz})$  with the maximal laser intensity  $q = 5 \times 10^{12}$  W cm<sup>-2</sup> focused onto a massive tungsten target. The s[pectra](#page-2-0) in the wavelength range  $\lambda = 2 - 20$  nm were studied by means of a calibrated spectrometer with a transmitting diffraction grating. The spectra were independently analysed at the P.N. Lebedev Physics Institute of the Russian Academy of Sciences (LPI, Moscow, Russia) [8]. The analysis of tungsten laserproduced plasma spectra obtained at BYU included the estimation of  $T_e$  by spectra of H- and He-like magnesium ions, correction of tungsten plasma temperature, and finding the spectr[al](#page-2-0) ranges in which the intensities are sensitive to  $T_e$ .

In diagnosing laser-produced plasmas, the X-ray spectra of H- and He-like magnesium ions were used [14, 15], which were studied by means of a high-luminosity focusing crystal spectrometer [16, 17]. At a maximal laser intensity  $q \sim 5 \times 12^{-12}$  $10^{12}$  W cm<sup>-2</sup> the measurements give the value of temperature  $T_e = 240 \pm 20$  eV, which well agrees with the results of measuring  $T_e$  by a continuum [14]. Then the [temperat](#page-2-0)ure  $T_e$ was made lower by reducing the laser pulse energy, assuming the [variation](#page-2-0) of  $T_e$  obeys (1).

The electron temperature  $T_{\rm e}^{\rm Mg}$  was determined in magnesium laser-produced [plasm](#page-2-0)as. In accordance with the dependence  $T_e \sim A_Z^{2/9}$ , the temperature should be corrected to tungsten laser plasmas and the corrected electron temperature should be ascribed to each of the spectra:  $T_e^{\text{W}} = 1.57 T_e^{\text{Mg}}$ . Examples of the tungsten spectra at various temperatures  $T_e^{\text{W}}$  are presented in Fig. 2. One can see a characteristic structure of the spectra  $-$  the peaks in the ranges of  $2.5 - 4.2$  nm (peak 1) and  $4.5 - 6.5$  nm (peak 2), which are identified  $[3]$  as transitions  $4-5$  in tungsten ions  $XXII - XXIX$  and 4-4 in tungsten ions  $XXVIII - XXX$ , respectively. Note that the intensity 'fall' in the spectra at  $\lambda \geq 20$  nm is, seemingly, related to a reduction of the efficiency of the e[mploy](#page-2-0)ed spectrometer. The structure of spectra and intensities in the mentioned spectral ranges (peaks) are sensitive to the electron temperature, which was used for  $T_e$  measurements.

There are the following features in tungsten spectra (see Fig. 2). At low temperatures ( $T_e^{\text{W}} \sim 250 \text{ eV}$ ), the intensity has maxima at the wavelengths  $\lambda_{\text{max}} \sim 5.0 \text{ nm}$  (peak 2), 12.5 and 17 nm, the intensities of the last two peaks exceeding that of peak 2. At higher  $T_e^{\mathbf{W}}$ , the relative intensity of peak 2 increases and at  $T_e^{\text{W}} \sim 400 \text{ eV}$  it is approximately twice that of the long-wavelength peaks. This fact may be used in taking measurements at relatively low temperatures. Starting from  $T_e^W \ge 250$  eV, the spectra exhibit a shortwavelength peak 1 at  $\lambda_{\text{max}} \sim 4 \text{ nm}$ , whose intensity  $I_1$ relative to the intensity  $I_2$  of peak 2 increases with  $T_e^W$ . The corresponding spectral range is shown in Fig. 2, and the temperature  $T_e^{\mathbf{W}}$  versus the intensity ratio  $I_1/I_2$  is presented in Fig. 3.

The dependence of temperature  $T_e^{\text{W}}$  (in eV) versus the intensity ratio of peak 1 to peak 2 is well approximated by the expression (see Fig. 3)

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

**Figure 2.** Spectra of tungsten laser-produced plasmas obtained at various electron temperatures  $T_e^W$ . Numeral 1 denotes the peaks corresponding to transitions  $4-5$  in tungsten ions XXII-XXIX, numeral 2 refers to the peaks corresponding to  $4-4$  transitions in tungsten ions XXVIII-XXX.

$$
T_{\rm e}^{\rm W} = A \left(\frac{I_1}{I_2}\right)^{\alpha} \tag{2}
$$

with the constants  $\alpha = 0.3$  and  $A = 700$ .

Similar investigations of tungsten spectra were performed at the LPI [18]. The tungsten spectra were recorded using another laser facility  $(0.53 \mu, 1 \text{ J}, 2 \text{ ns})$  under different experimental conditions. The laser-produced plasmas were diagnosed by the spectra of H- and He-like magnesium ions as well. The spectra were recorded at the temperature  $T_e^{\text{Mg}} = 200 \text{ eV}$ , which corresponds to  $T_{\rm e}^{\rm W}$  = 315 eV. The ratio of peak intensities  $I_1/I_2$  was 0.1. These data are also shown in Fig. 3. A comparison of the data with those obtained at BYU allows one to estimate the experimental error of determining  $T_e^{\text{W}}$  (not exceeding 10%) due to different experimental conditions.



**Figure 3.** Temperature  $T_e^W$  (in eV) as a function of intensity ratio  $I_1/I_2$ . Solid line is the calculation by formula (2), points correspond to the experimental results obtained at BYU  $(\square)$  and LPI ( $\blacksquare$ ).

The new X-ray spectral method of comparison may be used for estimating an electron temperature of heavyelement plasmas in various plasma sources including high-power Z-pinch plasmas based on multi-wire tungsten arrays.

Acknowledgements. The author is grateful to P.V. Sasorov, G.N. Sarkisov, E.B. Grabovskii, and V.V. Aleksandrov for discussion of the results and valuable remarks. The work was supported by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research (Grant No. 09-02-00154a).

### References

- 1. Presnyakov L.P. Usp. Fiz. Nauk, 119, 49 (1976) [ Sov. Phys. Usp., 19, 387 (1976)].
- 2. Vainshtein L.A., Safronova U.I., Urnov A.M. Trudy FIAN, 119, 13 (1980) [ Proc. Lebedev Phys. Inst., 119, 13 (1980)].
- 3. Chowdhuri M.B., Morita S., Goto M., et al. Plasmas Fusion Research: Regular Articles, 2, S1060 (2007).
- 4. Spielman R.B. et al. Phys. Plasmas, 5, 2105 (1998).
- 5. Bakshi V. (Ed.) EUV Sources for Lithography (Billingham, USA: SPIE Press, 2006).
- 6. Vainshtein L.A., Sobelman I.I., Yukov E.A. Excitation of Atoms and Broadening of Spectral Lines (Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 1981).
- 7. Shevelko A.P., Bliss D.E., et al. Fiz. Plazmy, 34, 1021 (2008) [ Plasma Phys. Reports, 34, 944 (2008)].
- 8. Shevelko A.P. Preprint FIAN No.6 (Moscow, 2011).
- 9. Boiko V.A., Krokhin O.N., Sklizkov G.V. Trudy FIAN, 76, 186 (1974) [ Proc. Lebedev Phys. Inst., 76, 186 (1974)].
- 10. Anan'in O.B., Afanas'ev Yu.V., Bykovskii Yu.A., Krokhin O.N. Lazernaya plazma. Fizika i primenenie (Laser Plasma. Physics and Applications) (Moscow: MEPhI, 2003).
- 11. Bykovskii Yu.A., Degtyarenko N.N., et al. Zh. Eksp. Teor. Fiz., 60, 1306 (1971).
- 12. Bergeson S., Gray N., Harrison M., Knight L., et al. Proc. 2008 Int. Workshop on EUV Lithography (Maui, Hawaii, 2008) p. 38.
- 13. Yakushev O., Shevelko A., Bergeson S., Gray N., Harrison M., Knight L. Materialy soveshchaniya 'Rentgenovskaya optika - $2008'$  (Abstracts of Papers 'X-Ray Optics  $-2008'$ ) (Chernogolovka, 2008) p. 84.
- 14. Shevelko A.P., Knight L.V., Wang Q., Yakushev O.F. Proc. SPIE Int. Soc. Opt. Eng., 4504, 215 (2001).
- 15. Shevelko A.P., Knight L.V., Peatross J.B., Wang Q. Proc. SPIE Int. Soc. Opt. Eng., 4505, 171 (2001).
- 16. Shevelko A.P. Proc. SPIE Int. Soc. Opt. Eng., 3406, 91 (1998).
- 17. Shevelko A.P. et al. Rev. Sci. Instrum., 73, 3458 (2002).
- 18. Shevelko A.P., Andreev S.N., Bliss D.E., et al. Preprint FIAN No. 22 (Moscow, 2007)].